∠8

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

PURECHOICE INC.,

Plaintiff(s),

V.

ORDER TRANSFERRING

PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO

COMPEL

Defendant(s).

Before the court is plaintiff's motion to compel nonparty Kathleen Macke to comply with subpoenas issued in this
district in a lawsuit which is pending in the United States
District Court for the District of Minnesota. Ms. Macke
resides in this district.

At a telephone conference held on October 31, 2008, at which all parties were represented by counsel, including Minnesota counsel, it became clear that this dispute is best resolved by the district court in Minnesota. The witness's principal objections to the subpoenas are that discovery is precluded by her settlement with plaintiff of an earlier Minnesota lawsuit and that the key documents plaintiff seeks

Case 3:08-mc-80210-JSW Document 22 Filed 11/04/08 Page 2 of 2

are protected by the attorney-client privilege. Both of these issues are presently being litigated in the District of Minnesota, thus creating the possibility of inconsistent resolutions. During the telephone conference, when presented with the possibility of transfer, all parties and the non-party consented or did not object.

I am informed by the Honorable Susan R. Nelson, the magistrate judge assigned to this matter in Minnesota, that she is familiar with these issues and that this dispute should be referred back to the District of Minnesota for resolution.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that plaintiff's motion to compel Ms.

Macke to comply with the subpoenas issued in this District is transferred to the United States District Court for the District of Minnesota for resolution. Devlin v.

Transportation Communications International Union, 2000 WL 249286 (S.D.N.Y.), citing In re Digital Equipment Corp., 949

F.2d 228, 231 (8th Cir. 1991). Plaintiff shall renotice the motion on Judge Nelson's calendar.

21 Bernard Zimmerman
22 United States Magistrate Judge

G:\BZALL\-REFS\PURECHOICE V. MACKE\TRANSFER ORDER.wpd

Dated: November 4, 2008